### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF ALABAMA NORTHERN DIVISION

GINGER CRAVEY, as Administratrix of the	)
Estate of RILEY CRAVEY, deceased,	)
Plaintiff,	)
vs.	) CASE NUMBER: 2:06-cv-191-WKW-DRB
TMA FOREST PRODUCTS GROUP, et al.	)
Defendants.	)
	)

## **DEFENDANT PACTIV CORPORATION'S** RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO ALLOW AMENDED COMPLAINT AND MOTION TO STRIKE

Defendant Pactiv Corporation ("Pactiv") submits this response to Plaintiff's Motion to Allow Amended Complaint and moves to strike paragraph 110 of the proposed First Amended Complaint as it relates to Pactiv. In support thereof, Pactiv states as follows:

- 1. On April 24, 2006, Plaintiff filed a Motion to Allow Amended Complaint seeking to delete Counts 9 (spoliation) and 10 (homicide) as causes of action. Pactiv does not oppose Plaintiff's motion to the extent that it seeks to delete the spoliation and homicide counts, as neither count presents a recognized cause of action under Alabama law.
- 2. Plaintiff, however, continues to allege that "Plaintiffs are entitled to the benefit of the substantive law of the State of Alabama, including an inference of Defendants' guilt, culpability or awareness of their liability because of spoliation of evidence." First Am. Compl. at ¶ 110 (Emphasis added).
  - 3. Plaintiff has alleged no basis for claims of spoliation against Pactiv.

4. Plaintiff merely alleges (at ¶¶ 108-09) that Louisiana-Pacific Corporation—not Pactiv—destroyed or disposed of material evidence and documents. *See also* Pl.'s Resp. to Defs.' Mot. to Dismiss (attaching Affs. of Carlton Dukes and Connie Wayne Adams, which allege that Louisiana-Pacific, not Pactiv, may have destroyed relevant evidence).

WHEREFORE, Pactiv Corporation requests that the Court enter an order striking paragraph 110 of the proposed First Amended Complaint insofar as it alleges spoliation of the evidence as against Pactiv.

# Respectfully Submitted,

# s/ E. Bryan Nichols

H. Thomas Wells, Jr. Bar Number: WEL004 twells@maynardcooper.com

John A. Earnhardt Bar Number: EAR006

jearnhardt@maynardcooper.com

E. Bryan Nichols Bar Number: NIC036

bnichols@maynardcooper.com

#### **OF COUNSEL:**

MAYNARD, COOPER & GALE, P.C. 1901 Sixth Avenue North Suite 2400 Birmingham, Alabama 35203 Telephone: (205) 254-1000 Facsimile: (205) 254-1999

John C. Berghoff Jr Mark R. Ter Molen Matthew C. Sostrin

Admitted Pro Hac Vice

MAYER, BROWN, ROWE & MAW, LLP

71 S. Wacker Drive Chicago, Illinois 60606

Attorneys for Defendant *Pactiv Corporation* 

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on May 17, 2006, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the following:

#### COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANTS LOUISIANA-PACIFIC CORPORATION

Dennis R. Bailey R. Austin Huffaker Rushton, Stakely, Johnston & Garrett P. O. Box 270 Montgomery, AL 36101

#### COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFF

W. Eason Mitchell Colon Law Firm P. O. Box 866 Columbus, MS 39703

Robert L. Palmer Gregory A. Cade W. Lee Gresham III Fred R. DeLeon **Environmental Litigation Group** 3529 Seventh Avenue South Birmingham, AL 35222

### s/ E. Bryan Nichols

E. Bryan Nichols 1901 Sixth Avenue North **Suite 2400** Birmingham, Alabama 35203 Telephone: (205) 254-1184

Facsimile: (205) 254-1999

E-mail: bnichols@maynardcooper.com

Bar Number: NIC036